



AGENCY:	City Council
MEETING DATE:	January 14, 2019
DEPARTMENT:	Public Works
PRESENTED BY:	Diane O'Connor
EMAIL ADDRESS:	doconnor@fortbragg.com

AGENDA ITEM SUMMARY

TITLE:

Receive Report and Recommendation of Public Works and Facilities Committee and Consider Adoption of City Council Resolution Approving Professional Services Agreement with Coleman Engineering for the Raw Water Line Replacement Project Design Engineering, City Project 2018-02, and Authorize City Manager to Execute Contract (Amount Not to Exceed \$680,000; from Water Enterprise Capital Reserve Fund 615)

ISSUE:

The Public Works Department was authorized by City Council to release the Request for Proposals (RFP) for the Raw Water Line Replacement Project Design on September 10, 2018. On October 26, 2018, the City received three (3) responsive bids. The project is very complex and the bid responses are challenging to evaluate against each other, so the matter was presented to the Public Works and Facilities Committee on November 14, 2018. The Committee recommended awarding the contract to Coleman Engineering.

ANALYSIS:

The lowest bidder is KASL Consulting Engineers, with a \$233,650 base proposal. Their proposal appears to offer a lower level of service than either Coleman Engineering or Stantec. The highest bidder, Stantec, came in with a \$449,161 base proposal. Coleman Engineering's base proposal is \$399,693, just under the original budget for this task of \$400,000. Coleman and Stantec proposals are much closer to budget than KASL, suggesting that their proposals more closely match the anticipated level of service. Many of KASL's proposed costs for services are less than half the price of the other two. Both Coleman and Stantec have demonstrated a strong interest in this project and have spent a substantial amount of time evaluating the project in order to provide exceptional proposals.

The timeframe for the design is approximately the same for KASL and Coleman, while Stantec proposes a much longer timeline (an additional 160 working days or 76% more time than Coleman's schedule) for the 100% plan and specification bid set. Stantec feels the extended time line is necessary due to all studies, permitting and funding activities, although those tasks are not included in the base price.

Environmental review and permitting are important ancillary tasks associated with this design. Approximately 10,000 feet of pipeline is ready to be replaced or rehabilitated. Assuming a modest 50-foot wide construction zone, this means that up to 500,000 square feet (or 11-1/2 acres) of forest could be disturbed. Creative designs that do not solely rely on digging up and replacing pipe are essential. Pipeline replacement/rehabilitation options will be heavily influenced by environmental constraints. A superior design will integrate both tasks into the same work product. Both Coleman and Stantec proposed trenchless technology and suggest alternate alignments to reduce environmental impacts. By extension, this would substantially reduce construction costs. KASL did not mention any noteworthy experience with trenchless technology.

The department believes that the City will have a better-planned and more cost effective project if

AGENDA ITEM NO. 7E

we select the additional tasks of Environmental Studies and Permitting, Funding Assistance, and the Timber Harvest Plan (THP). The ability to integrate the environmental efforts with the design efforts will allow for a simpler and more efficient permitting process than if the City were to perform the tasks in-house, particularly as City staff resources are severely limited. Combining services will help with overall costs by eliminating task overlaps. Below is a summary of “Additional Task” costs:

	Base Bid	Timber Harvest	notes	Subtotal	Environmental/ Biological	notes	Subtotal	Funding	notes	Base plus additional
COLEMAN	\$399,693	\$90,471	single integrated plan	\$490,164	\$83,932	Basic service included in base, Complete for additional cost	\$574,096	\$20,000	subcontract	\$594,096
KASL	\$233,650	\$50,000	single plan; phased \$25k ea	\$283,650	\$41,680	Biologic and Cultural evaluation	\$325,330	no additional cost	very basic	\$325,330
STANTEC	\$449,161	\$61,248	2 phases	\$510,409	\$161,760	Complete Environmental	\$672,169	\$86,856	in-house experience	\$759,025

We feel that the choice is most appropriately limited to the Coleman and Stantec proposals because of the proposal strength disparity with KASL. We are concerned about the apparent lower level of service offered by KASL. Coleman and Stantec appear to be offering a similar level of service in their proposals.

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

Staff and the Public Works Committee recommend awarding the \$594,096 contract to Coleman Engineering, and including their additional tasks as part of the contract. Staff also recommends that the contract include a contingency amount of 14% for a total budget allocation of \$680,000.

ALTERNATIVE ACTION(S):

Council can chose to award the contract to one of the other firms that submitted proposals or to delay contract award until a future date.

FISCAL IMPACT:

The 2017-2018 budget allotted \$400,000 for design services and the 2018-2019 budget allotted \$682,000 for construction of the first phase. As construction will not occur for at least another year, we propose reallocating the additional money from the construction budget for the first phase to fully fund the contract amount. We anticipate that the construction will have grant funding which may be used to backfill the reallocated amount. One of the additional tasks of this contract will be to assist with securing that funding.

CONSISTENCY:

The Coleman proposal is consistent with the objectives of the project.

IMPLEMENTATION/TIMEFRAMES:

Many of the environmental studies that must be performed as part of this project are required to be accomplished during the spring. It is in the best interest of the City to start the process as soon as possible to avoid substantial delays of one (1) year or more.

ATTACHMENTS:

1. Resolution
2. Contract
3. Coleman Engineering Proposal

NOTIFICATION:

Coleman Engineering (chad@coleman-eng.com)