



AGENCY:	City Council
MEETING DATE:	February 8, 2016
DEPARTMENT:	CDD
PRESENTED BY:	M Jones

AGENDA ITEM SUMMARY REPORT

TITLE:

RECEIVE RECOMMENDATION FROM COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE REGARDING THREE BIDS FOR A NEW FORT BRAGG WELCOME SIGN DESIGN AND PROVIDE DIRECTION TO STAFF

ISSUE:

The Fort Bragg Welcome Sign was erected on private property in the 1990's to eliminate event signage at the intersection of Highway 20 with Highway 1 and to provide a more welcoming entrance to our community. The existing Welcome Sign, while functional, has become visually cluttered with a large number and variety of signs, making everything difficult to read at 45 miles per hour. Additionally, the City approved a subdivision at this site in 2014, which included the dedication of a sign easement on a site closer to the Noyo Bridge, just past the Q Restaurant. The property owner would be pleased if the City would relocate this sign this spring, so that they could proceed with site improvements for the subdivision.

This item was considered by City Council in March 2013 as part of the Fort Bragg Wayfinding Plan and direction was provided regarding placement, location and design of the Welcome Sign. After much discussion, City Council provided direction to redesign the Welcome Sign face and include only the service club emblems, below the sign.

The City must obtain an encroachment permit from Caltrans to relocate this sign as both the new and the old sign are subject to Caltrans right of way control. Caltrans has indicated that the event signage will not be permitted as part of the Welcome Sign. Caltrans considers the event signage to be a form of commercial advertising and it would need to be permitted separately and located further from the roadway. Caltrans initially expressed a desire to eliminate the service club emblems, however they have softened their position on this issue.



Caltrans considers the event signage to be a form of commercial advertising and it would need to be permitted separately and located further from the roadway. Caltrans initially expressed a desire to eliminate the service club emblems, however they have softened their position on this issue.

The City released an RFP in December of 2015 for submittal of bids on the Welcome Sign design and construction costs, per the City's informal bidding process for construction projects with a cost of less than \$25,000. This project was bid as a design/build project.

On January 15, 2016, the City received three qualified bids from three local sign contractors, all of whom designed beautiful alternatives for the Fort Bragg Welcome Sign. The proposal bids and designs were received from ArtStruct, The Sign Shop, and Braggadoon.

On January 26th, the Community Development Committee (CDC) reviewed the proposals and discussed the designs and pros and cons of each proposal.

Overall the CDC preferred the ArtStruct Welcome Sign design, with the Braggadoon sign design coming in second and the Sign Shop design a close third.

Additionally, the CDC asked staff to work with each proposer to resubmit their design with slight modifications for further consideration by City Council. Specifically, CDC asked for the following changes:

1. ArtStruct Proposal – Design Option 2 was preferred, CDC requested that: 1) the lights be removed from the design and that lighting be achieved with LED or ground mounted lights; and 2) the sign letters be painted a different color so that they are more visible from the roadway. Please see Attachment 1 for the revised ArtStruct design proposal which illustrates colored letters and Attachment 1b which illustrates stainless steel letters.
2. Braggadoon Proposal – Design Option 1 was preferred, CDC requested that: 1) the design address the eventual greying of the redwood, especially with regard to the visibility of the aluminum letters on a grey background; and 2) a complete cost estimate be submitted. Please see Attachment 2 for the revised Braggadoon design proposal. In order to address the eventual greying out of the redwood slabs, Braggadoon proposes the following two options:
 - a. Painting the surface of the flat faced lettering at a later date to compensate for any loss of contrast
 - b. Stain the wood darker at the onset for long term contrast.
3. The Sign Shop Proposal – Design Option C was preferred, CDC requested that the cost proposal be adjusted to reflect a larger sign of 6’ by 16’ (or a size comparable to the other submittals). Please see Attachment 3 for the revised Sign Shop design proposal which illustrates a larger sign and the new cost proposal.

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

Provide direction to staff regarding the new Fort Bragg Welcome Sign Design. Once a preferred design is selected, a contract and budget amendment will be brought forward for Council action.

ALTERNATIVE ACTION(S):

No alternative is needed.

ANALYSIS:

The selection and construction of a new Fort Bragg Welcome Sign will set the tone for visitors to our town for many years. All three sign artists have prepared interesting and exciting sign designs for our community entry. To assist with the review process, the following table summarizes some of each proposal’s technical information.

Table 1: Technical Specification Comparison for Welcome Sign Proposals

	ArtStruct	The Sign Shop	Braggadoon
Sign Size	6 feet high by 18 feet long	6 feet high by 16 feet long	5 feet high by 19 feet long
Sign Size Total SF	108	96	95
Painted Art Surface	Yes	Yes	No

Carved Wood Surface	Yes, CNC carved	Yes, carved & sand blasted	No
Number of Design Options	2	3	2
Stainless Steel Construction	Yes	Unknown	Yes, except for aluminum lettering
Redwood Type	Sign created from joined 3X6 Heart B Redwood Beam Stock	3" Thick Heart B, fastened together with through bolts	Redwood slab
Post Type	Noyo Harbor Pier & Redwood Column	Unknown	Stainless Steel and Fishing Chain
Lighting	None	None	LED Lighting
Electric hookup	No	No	No
Delivery Timeframe	60+ days	90 days	14 days
Total Cost	\$14,430	\$15,850	\$12,200 - \$12,600

The existing Welcome Sign, which is 16 feet long by 6 feet high, is 96 square feet. Figure 1 below illustrates each proposal sign size relative to the existing sign.



FISCAL IMPACT:

Funding for the construction of the Welcome Sign has not been identified. This project was not part of the 2015/16 Capital Improvement Program (CIP). In order to proceed with the project this year a budget adjustment would be required.

CONSISTENCY:

The proposed project is consistent with the Fort Bragg Wayfinding Plan, which specifically identified the need for a new and updated Welcome Sign in Fort Bragg.

IMPLEMENTATION/TIMEFRAMES:

The new Welcome Sign could be constructed and installed as soon as funding is identified for the project and a contract is executed. It will take 2-3 months for the sign to be fabricated and installed.

ATTACHMENTS:

Attachment 1: ArtStruct proposal and design

Attachment 2: The Sign Shop proposal and design

Attachment 3: Braggadoon proposal and design

Attachment 4: RFP for Welcome Sign

City Clerk's Office Use Only

Agency Action ☐ Approved ☐ Denied ☐ Approved as Amended

Resolution No.: _____ Ordinance No.: _____

Moved by: _____ Seconded by: _____

Vote: _____

☐ Deferred/Continued to meeting of: _____

☐ Referred to: _____