



AGENCY: City Council  
MEETING DATE: December 09, 2019  
DEPARTMENT: Public Works  
PRESENTED BY: C. O'Neal  
EMAIL ADDRESS: [coneal@fortbragg.com](mailto:coneal@fortbragg.com)

## AGENDA ITEM SUMMARY

### **TITLE:**

**Receive Report and Consider Adoption of City Council Resolution Approving Professional Services Agreement to Contract With R.E.Y. Engineers, Inc. to Provide Design and Engineering Services for the 2020 Maple Street Storm Drain and Alleys Rehab Project, City Project No. PWP-00116, and Authorizing City Manager to Execute Contract (Amount Not To Exceed \$124,890.00; Account No.405-4870-0731)**

### **ISSUE:**

On November 26, 2019, three civil engineering consulting firms submitted proposals for engineering and design services for the 2020 Maple Street Storm Drain and Alley Rehab Project. The Public Works Department reviewed the proposals and recommends that R.E.Y. Engineers, Inc. be selected as the design engineering firm for the project. All proposals were responsive and timely. This firm is well qualified to perform the work, and the base proposal cost submitted was below the estimated \$125,000 allotted for the design of the street project. R.E.Y.'s proposal indicated additional value added tasks for geotechnical work that staff feels is necessary to include. R.E.Y. and staff worked to amend the firms proposed tasks so that the geotechnical work was included and the total contract Not to Exceed amount of \$124,890 stayed below the allocated amount.

### **ANALYSIS:**

The Public Works Department and City Council identified the Maple Street Storm Drain Replacement Project in the 2019/2020 FY CIP budget. In October of 2019, the scope of work for this project was expanded to include rehab of four City alleys as well. This scope of work was reviewed and approved by City Council prior to release of the Request for Proposals (RFP) on October 31, 2019. The project includes replacement of a failing stormdrain line, three new drain inlets to be installed in the Maple Street project area, and the Maple Street pavement segment and the four (4) alleys selected for this project will receive full rehabilitation.

The table below (Table 1: RFP Evaluation) summarizes the most important components of each proposal and details the overall ranking based on the review of the submittals by staff. Both the proposals of R.E.Y. and LACO provide what staff perceives to be an adequate level of service. The last two designs produced by KASL (Chestnut Street Corridor Multi-Use Path and 2017 Street Rehabilitation Project) were difficult to construct with bid documents they provided. At this time, staff does not recommend using their services. While LACO's proposal presented the lowest cost for services (at about 70% of the proposed design budget), the quality of the submittal left staff feeling concerned about the value of their proposed services. The proposal was full of spelling and typographical errors, had incorrect pagination, and showed little understanding of the work to be done. It is difficult to understand how they arrived at the estimate of costs not displaying an understanding of the work to be completed.

## RFP Evaluation

Responding Firms	Key Components of the Proposal	Schedule	Cost	Score (100 possible)	Overall Ranking
<b>KASL Consulting Engineers</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Clear understanding of project</li> <li>• Completed the reference documents (Alley Master Plan and Storm Drain Master Plan)</li> <li>• Previous design work performed for the City with issues</li> <li>• Very small staff committed to project with short delivery window</li> <li>• Recommended alternative surface treatments which included permeable pavers</li> <li>• Proposal includes a pavement specialist and geotechnical engineers as sub consultants included in base price</li> </ul>	11 Weeks	\$ 92,050.00	71	3
<b>R.E.Y. Engineers, Inc.</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Did extensive pre-submittal research</li> <li>• Showed clear understanding of the scope of work</li> <li>• Noted ADA issues and concerns of shallow utilities, and drainage flow patterns</li> <li>• Suggested LID and cost saving design alternatives</li> <li>• Uses LiDar for survey data collection</li> <li>• Geotechnical Soils investigation for recommending pavement rehabilitation</li> <li>• Extensive relevant project experience</li> </ul>	20 Weeks	\$124,890.00	95	1
<b>LACO Associates, Inc.</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Lacked clear general understanding of project</li> <li>• Many errors (both in spelling and job description locations), missing cover page and did not include contact information for firm</li> <li>• They are currently contracted to perform City Engineering services for a local municipality-which indicates familiarity with processes, standards, and administrative procedures</li> <li>• Mixed success with previous recent designs</li> <li>• This proposal includes a geotechnical investigation</li> </ul>	14 Weeks	\$ 88,400.00	78	2

Staff feels strongly that R.E.Y.'s organized proposal, concise timeline for design completion, proposed value added extras, QA/QC, and their extra diligence in pre-proposal research about this project shows their commitment to delivering the City a successful project. One of the most important components of a good design is attention to detail and quality control of the submittal, something that was best represented by the submittal from R.E.Y. An example of this from their proposal is their assertion that up to \$50,000 in construction costs can be saved by utilizing the in-depth geotechnical information from their geotechnical investigation option to optimize the street thickness design and minimize materials used. If selected, City staff would continue to work with R.E.Y. to find other substantial construction cost savings reflecting their higher level care and detail during design. Engineering staff also believes that optimized or inventive designs can be used in other future projects. The City is always looking at bringing new and innovative designers to perform work on the coast and staff feels that R.E.Y. will make us a regular client.

**RECOMMENDED ACTION:**

Adopt Resolution approving Professional Services Agreement with R.E.Y. Engineers Inc. to Provide Design and Engineering Services for the 2020 Maple Street Storm Drain and Alley Rehab Project, City Project No. PWP-00116, and Authorizing City Manager to Execute Contract (Amount Not To Exceed \$124,890.00).

**ALTERNATIVE ACTION(S):**

1. Adopt Resolution approving Professional Services Agreement with LACO Associates, Inc. to Provide Design and Engineering Services for the 2020 Maple Street Storm Drain and Alley Rehab Project, City Project No. PWP-00116, and Authorizing City Manager to Execute Contract (Amount Not To Exceed \$88,400.00); or
2. Reject all proposals and solicit a new Request for Proposals (RFPs).

**FISCAL IMPACT:**

The Design and Engineering portion of this project was estimated at \$125,000, and a total project budget of \$1,800,000. The 2020 Maple Street Storm Drain and Alley Rehab Project is funded in part through SB-1 Local Partnership Program (LPP) funds in the amount of \$100,000 and the remaining amount of \$1,700,000 is verified as being available for funding with City's Special Sales Tax money. City Special Street Sales tax monies are received from a half-cent sales tax which is restricted to City Street and alley repairs/rehabilitation. Staff will bring forward a budget amendment in the spring of 2020 once the engineers estimate is substantially complete and prior to the project going out to bid.

**GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS IMPACT:**

There is little to no increase in Greenhouse gas emissions associated with the Design Engineering portion of this project. There is a slightly higher emissions impact associated with the selection of either R.E.Y. Engineers, Inc. or KASL Consulting Engineers versus LACO Associates, Inc. due to the increased driving distance required to travel to Fort Bragg.

**CONSISTENCY:**

The Maple Street portion of this project is consistent with the City's Capital Improvement Plan (CIP) budget for street repair. The primary funding source for this project is Special

Street Sales Tax, Measure H. This special purpose transaction and use tax was passed by the voters in 2004 and extended again in 2014. The special sales tax is currently scheduled to sunset in 2024. This City's Special Street Sales Tax, makes us a "Self-Help" City under RMRA, which entitles us to the additional \$100,000 in state funds described above as available for this project. The proposed use of both the Special Street Sales tax and RMRA funds is consistent with their intended use for repairing, maintaining and reconstructing City streets and underlying infrastructure.

**IMPLEMENTATION/TIMEFRAMES:**

Project design engineering is scheduled for this winter and spring. Once designed, the project will be released for bid in late spring/early summer of 2020 with the intent of catching the most competitive bidding environment. The construction contract will likely be sixty (60) to ninety (90) working days and construction should be complete for final billing by November 2020.

**ATTACHMENTS:**

1. Resolution to Approve Professional Services Agreement with R.E.Y. Engineers Inc.

**NOTIFICATION:**

1. KASL Consulting Engineers; John C. Scroggs, PE Principal-in-Charge
2. LACO Associates, Inc.; Holly Cinkutis, PE Senior Engineer
3. R.E.Y. Engineers, Inc.; Aaron Brusatori, PE Project Manager